

Leadership and decision-making in the workplace and public life¹ Afternoon breakout group discussion

To support the breakout group discussion, this paper summarises suggestions made in the videos circulated in advance of the meeting and submissions received during the Public Consultation process (www.citizensassembly.ie/!GNZAU1). It also highlights examples of actions/case studies from other countries² to encourage female leadership in media and business (pages 7-10). Where a suggestion from a submission or video is included, a link is provided.

This paper is intended as a reminder of what you have read and seen in the material circulated in advance of the meeting. You may want to refer to some of the ideas in it during the breakout group discussion but it is not intended, nor would it be possible, for you to discuss every suggestion in this paper in the breakout group.

Part 1- Suggestions for recommendations from videos & submissions

<u>Please note the order in which these recommendations are presented does not imply any ranking or judgement on these by the Secretariat.</u>

Quotas (for background information on quotas and the most commonly used arguments for and against quotas see pages 5-6)

- 1. In the media introduce quotas for experts on panel shows, or quotas in leadership positions in broadcasting companies (Submissions: <u>CA30191</u>, <u>CA30257</u>, <u>CA30269</u>, <u>CA30204</u>)
- 2. Legislate for quotas on state boards with consequences for failure to meet quotas (Submissions: <u>CA30179</u>, <u>CA30191</u>, Lian Bell video, IHREC video) (The current target is that each State Board should have at least 40%

¹ The Oireachtas Resolution invites the Citizens' Assembly to make recommendations to advance gender equality by bringing forward proposals that "in particular, seek to ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision making in the workplace, politics and public life

² Sources include the OECD, the European Institute for Gender Equality and the European Commission

- representation from each gender. In December 2018, the average gender balance across all State Boards stood at 41.5% female and 58.5% male members. However, less than half (48%) of individual Boards had met the 40% target.)
- 3. Increase current targets for state boards, including sports bodies (Sports Ireland video)
- 4. Introduce quotas at national level for private boards through legislation or guidelines (Submissions: <u>CA30179</u>, <u>CA30191</u>, Lian Bell video, IHREC video)
- 5. Introduce quotas across areas of public life (Submissions video, Lian Bell video)

Education & awareness raising

- 6. Awareness campaigns outlining the benefits of increasing women in leadership positions and representation in public life including in management and board positions (Submissions: <u>CA30249</u>; Submissions video; OECD, EIGE, Julie Sinnamon video)
- 7. Education guides and training to address stereotypes and promote gender equality for students, and other informal education methods on gender equality e.g. gender diversity training, conferences and cultural events (Submissions: CA30189, CA30089; EIGE; Lian Bell video, Sports Ireland video).
- 8. Improve education and supports from a young age encouraging leadership qualities in girls, compulsory modules in gender equality and diversity (Submission video; Lian Bell video).
- 9. De-gender schools, curricula and classrooms (Lian Bell video)
- 10.Provide reskilling, upskilling and re-entry for carers who return to the workforce. Encourage men to choose caring over career. (Lian Bell video)

Family friendly and work life balance measures

11. Mainstream work-life balance and family-friendly work practices and address the gendered division of care work through policy and legislative changes (Submissions: <u>CA30249</u>, Lian Bell video, IHREC video, OECD)

Role models and mentoring

- 12.Increase diversity in leadership across other marginalised groups including ethnicity, race, sexuality, socio-economic background and ability (Public Submission video, Lian Bell video, Maria Joyce video).
- 13.Improve the visibility of female leaders and role models across society, especially through the education system, including in the areas of entrepreneurship, management and senior leadership positions (Public submission video; Julie Sinnamon video; Lian Bell video)
- 14. Specific training, mentoring and resources directed female entrepreneurs and women in business and public institutions, and other areas where one gender is significantly under-represented in relation to others (Submissions: CA30191, CA30200, CA30249, CA30268; Submissions video; Lian Bell video; Sports Ireland video; EIGE)
- 15. Facilitate capacity and leadership development more broadly through mentoring, networking, and other training programmes to equip and encourage women to aim for leadership positions (Submissions: CA30191, CA30200, CA30249, CA30268; OECD)

Monitoring progress and strengthening institutions

- 16.Increasing capacity and resources of gender equality institutions (OECD)
- 17. Systematically monitor and highlight gender balance in public institutions and companies including in leadership positions through regular public reporting, require institutions to develop gender equality policies including measures aimed at increasing participation of women at all levels, with consequences for failure to do so (Submissions video, Julie Sinnamon video, Lian Bell video, Sports Ireland video OECD)
- 18.Include measures in the public procurement policy to improve gender equality, for example requirements for gender balanced senior management as part of the weighting procedure (Julie Sinnamon video).
- 19. Fund research on gender equality across society, including regular public reports which measure the gender equality picture in cultural and media industries, and research reviewing career development by gender and the impact of economic cycles on gendered access to leadership (Lian Bell video)
- 20.Increase resources to national and local broadcasting for women's participation in radio, film, sports and television industry (Submissions: CA30184, CA30204)
- 21.Implement gender sensitive policies and programmes in media organisations, for example mandated reporting of gender representation at

- programme level or access to State funding for media linked to balanced gender representation including presenters, sports and guests (Submissions: CA30257, CA30269; OECD, EIGE, Women on Air video).
- 22. Policy decisions relating to broadcasting should include a commitment to achieving gender equality on the airwaves (Women on Air video)

Law reform and regulation

- 23. Pass more extensive gender pay gap legislation requiring organisations to demonstrate how they are working to close the gender pay gap (Lian Bell video)
- 24. Sporting bodies in receipt of State funding be required to have gender balance on their boards and promote women's participation and leadership (IHREC video)
- 25.Governmental national action plan developed to ensure equal representation of women's sport in the media (IHREC video)

Business Practices

- 26.Improve the talent pipeline i.e. ensure career guidance is gender neutral, that women have equal access to the workplace including transparent recruitment processes and opportunities for development to access leadership positions (Submissions video, 30% club video)
- 27. Provide for a gender sensitive recruitment and selection processes to mitigate against unconscious bias—e.g. remove gender identifying information on applications (Submissions: CA30191, CA30249).
- 28. Measures to enable access to opportunities in senior public service, judicial appointments and boards e.g. disclosure requirements, target setting or quotas, while ensuring transparency and merit-based approach through recruitment (OECD; Sports Ireland video).
- 29. Encourage unconscious bias training in public bodies, private companies and for teachers and educators (Submissions: <u>CA30249</u>; Lian Bell video)
- 30.Ensure the quality of women's experiences in the workplace are high, so gender equality is not only based on numbers (Lian Bell video).
- 31.Be aware of bullying and harassment which can be gendered. Ensure processes do not favour the perpetrator (Lian Bell video).
- 32. Provide a focus on gender diversity in governance codes (Sports Ireland video).

Part 2: Quotas

Some people suggest the introduction or expansion of quotas for other parts of public life and leadership other than politics. Others are opposed to this.

In Ireland, all State boards have a mandated target of 40% female members. Up until 2020, Boards had to report whether or not they had reached this target. In 2020 additional requirements were introduced whereby any body that had not reached this target will have to report on measures that they will take to reach the target.

Other countries have introduced regulations for quotas on company boards:

Country	Type of quota	Share of women on boards in 2016 (EU-28 average 23.3%)
Austria	35% of state-owned supervisory boards by 2018.	20.1%
Belgium	33% for executives and non-executives in state-owned and listed companies by 2017, and in listed SMEs by 2019	26.6%
France	40% of non-executive directors in large listed and non-listed companies by 2017	37.1%
Germany	30% for supervisory boards of the top 110 biggest listed companies	27.2%
Greece	33% of board positions of companies fully or partially owned by the State	9.4%
Italy	33% for listed companies and state-owned companies by 2015	30%
Netherlands	30% of executive and supervisory boards of large companies (no sanctions, 'comply and explain' similar to Ireland)	28.1%
Spain	40% of executive and non-executive board members in state-owned companies with 250 or more employees (no sanctions)	20.2%

Source: https://ec.europa.eu/newsroom/document.cfm?doc_id=46280 Please note that this document is from 2016 and therefore may not be up to date.

Common arguments for and against quotas³

³ This is drawn from this article and is not in any particular order: https://www.newstatesman.com/business/2012/09/quotas-women-boards-all-pros-and-cons-one-place

For	Against
Quotas are the quickest and most effective way to ensure more equal numbers of men and women on boards.	Quotas discriminate against the individual men who happen to be running against a woman for a seat.
Quotas force the break up of elite circles that might otherwise remain unchallenged.	If women are employed through quotas, they will be seen as "token", will be less respected and will have less power.
If women are promoted into positions of power, they can act as positive role models for others.	Quotas set women against each other, competing for a certain number of "women's seats", which might destroy co-operation and unity.
Once on the board, women are more likely to hire more women.	Instating a quota might lend businesses to view them as a ceiling rather than a floor on the number of women, stalling progress on equality in the long run.
Quotas are not discriminatory, they simply correct existing discrimination.	

Part 3: Examples of international practice:

Women in the Media⁴

United Kingdom

The BBC's 50:50 The Equality Project began through the work of one programme (Outside Source) on the BBC and then, following positive results, was adopted across the network. Editorial and production teams monitor their contributors by gender representation and use it to set benchmarks and track progress. They only count the contributors that can be controlled (e.g. contributions by the only eyewitness to a crime, or a speech by the Prime Minister, isn't counted). The best contributor is always used, but collecting, monitoring and sharing the programmes data has still led to promising effects: starting with 39% female representation in January 2017, Outside Source had increased their average to 52% by the summer with programme viewership increasing by 25%.⁵

The Women in Film & Television UK association runs a <u>mid-career mentoring</u> <u>scheme</u> for 20 women annually. It is targeted at women with at least five years experience in any job in the sector who are facing a specific career challenge. Mentors (of either sex) spend six hours with mentees over a six-month period. There are also fortnightly meetings where participants meet to share knowledge and experience through peer-to-peer seminars.⁶

Netherlands

<u>Vaker in de media</u> (More often in the media) runs media training for female experts, teaching them how to build a media profile, how to approach media organisations, and how to speak and present themselves in front of an audience. This allows women experts to gain confidence in getting media attention. The organisation also operates a website which matches journalists with appropriate female experts for a story.

Austria

⁴ Mostly taken from here unless stated otherwise: https://eige.europa.eu/gender-mainstreaming/good-practices?section[]=627

⁵ This case study is discussed by the submission by Women on Air <u>CA30269</u>

⁶ Another mentoring programme for women in the media is highlighted in Germany

The Austrian national broadcaster Österreichischer Rundfunk (ORF) introduced a <u>six year gender equality plan</u> to promote gender equality and women's careers within its organisation. Actions within the Plan aim to promote gender equality and women's careers, abolish existing discrimination, to promote family friendly working practices for both women and men, and to achieve a share of 45% of women in areas where women are underrepresented (e.g. technical positions, higher management and studio directors).

NB: The Irish Broadcasting Authority published a Gender Action Plan in 2018.

Denmark

An online Expert Database in Denmark lists nearly 1,200 women from all areas of society available to act as experts for media. The aim of this database is to improve women's visibility in the media and their access to high-level positions in media organisations. The database provides journalists, employers, conference organisers and others with a user-friendly tool to find female experts with specific qualifications and skills in various fields. This is widely recognised as good practice, and those who run this website have helped local organisations to set up similar databases in Lebanon, Jordan and Egypt.⁷

Belgium

The Belgian Association of Professional Journalists surveyed the position of women in the French-language media in Belgium. The study found that only 28% of people interviewed in the media were women, and that only 26% of newspaper articles and 29% of radio news items are written or presented by women. After gathering this data, the Association conducted an awareness-raising campaign to bring this imbalance to the attention of policy-makers, judges, journalists and the general public. It also presented 11 good practices in implementing gender equality. The campaign brought the issue of female underrepresentation in the media to the attention of decision-makers.

⁷ Other countries who have instituted a database of female experts include the <u>Netherlands</u> (also discussed above), <u>France</u>

Romania

A series of <u>training courses</u> were developed for media professionals covering subjects like *Gender and the media in Romania* and *Eliminating gender stereotypes in the media*. The training courses aimed to provide media professionals with knowledge of gender discrimination in the media profession and encourage improved gender equality in media representation.

Leadership in industry, boards and culture 8

These case studies are based on actions taken by individual companies – most multinational and spread across a number of countries – and highlights how legislation assisted where relevant.

Enel Group

Enel Group, as part of a broader diversity and inclusion policy, introduced mentoring and shadowing programmes for women in managerial roles with the goal of ensuring women make up one third of potential successors in senior manager roles. The Board of Directors and Statutory Auditors are made up of one third women – this was achieved through Italian legislation on mandatory quotas in listed companies. Enel chose to permanently adopt a target of one-third women after the law expired.

RELX

In 2011 RELX committed to the target of women comprising one third of their board by 2020. To achieve this the company developed an inclusion dashboard which monitored real-time progress in gender equality broken down by role, function and length of service. They embedded flexible working in the organisation at all levels, spearheaded by the Global Head of Corporate Responsibility who worked flexibly herself to fit around her young children's needs. Finally, they instituted a mentoring and sponsorship programme including several women's networks to support career progression. The company hit its target of 30% by 2013, and by 2020 36% of board members and 44% of non-executive board members were women.

⁸ These examples are taken from this best practice database: https://www.weps.org/resource-category/case-studies

Orange Group

In 2019, following an agreement with trade unions to commit to achieve global gender equality, Orange Group instituted an international program with each local country developing its own targets. All targets would be monitored and reported on annually, with a summary of achievements sent to unions. This ensured transparency and accountability for each country operation to work towards the larger goal. One of the key targets for all countries was that women would hold 35% of managerial positions by 2025.

Tele2

In 2018, after merging with another Swedish IT services provider, only 9% of the global leadership team of <u>Tele2</u> were women. Alongside other actions, including engaging young women in the community and recruitment practices, they put in place a succession plan where for all leadership roles there should be at least one female possible successor. They have also implemented an executive training programme, which includes trainees shadowing a member of the leadership team for a full year. Selected trainees are able to be fast-tracked to executive level. Other processes are still being implemented, including unconscious bias training for new recruits and sponsorship of female talent by members of the leadership team. In 2019, women held 18% of senior leadership roles, doubling female representation in under a year.

Sodexo

In 2009 <u>Sodexo</u> put in place a plan to increase female representation in senior positions from only 17%. It involved awareness raising and discussion with current senior women to ensure buy in. A structure was formed to spearhead the operation – SoTogether Gender Advisory Board – which was initially made up of senior women and external influential individuals. In a second phase, more junior women and male champions were also included. It led the organisation's gender equality strategy and also encouraged the visibility of high potential women across the global organisation. To emphasise the importance, the Chair of the Sodexo Board chaired SoTogether for several years. Some key accomplishments include the development of 21 gender networks and 500 female participants in leadership development programmes.